

Opinion Paper: the Conseil des Montréalaises on

# The trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation

during the Formula 1 Canadian Grand Prix

## HIGHLIGHTS



The Conseil des Montréalaises extends its heartfelt thanks to all who participated in this process. Without their time and their voices, this opinion paper would not have been possible.

Participating organizations

AGIR (Action LGBTQ avec les immigrantEs et réfugiéEs)

Cactus Montréal

Centre d'éducation et d'action des femmes de Montréal (CÉAF)

Centre for Gender Advocacy/Centre de lutte contre l'oppression des genres

Immigrant Workers Centre (IWC)

Comité d'action contre la traite humaine interne et internationale (CATHII)/Coalition québécoise contre la traite des personnes

Concertation des luttes contre l'exploitation sexuelle (CLES)

Canadian Council for Refugees (CCR)

Fédération des maisons d'hébergement pour femmes (FMHF)

Quebec Native Women (QNW)

Native Women's Shelter of Montreal (NWSM)/Foyer pour femmes autochtones de Montréal (FFAM)

L'Anonyme

La Maison d'Haïti

La Sortie/The Way Out

Le Phare des affranchi(e)s/Beacon of the Freed

Mouvement contre le viol et l'inceste/Movement Against Rape and Incest (MCVI)

Projet ado-communautaire en travail de rue (PACT de rue)

Project 10

Stella, l'amie de Maimie

Women's Y of Montréal (YWCA)

November 2021

**Legal deposit**

Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec

ISBN: 978-2-7647-1862-9 – English PDF

**CONSEIL DES MONTRÉALAISES**

1550 Metcalfe, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor, Suite 1424

Montréal, Quebec H3A 1X6

Telephone: 514-868-5809

The “Opinion Paper: The Conseil des Montréalaises on the Trafficking of Women for the Purposes of Sexual Exploitation during the Formula 1 Canadian Grand Prix” (on which these highlights are based) was adopted by the members of the Conseil des Montréalaises (CM) at the regular meeting held July 8, 2020 and was submitted to the Municipal Council of the City of Montreal.

### **The Conseil des Montréalaises 2017-2020 working committee**

Dorothy Alexandre, Anuradha Dugal, Sharon Hackett, Josiane Maheu, Marie-Ève Maillé, Marie-Ève Rancourt, Selma Tannouche Bennani

### **Research**

#### Research coordinator

Aurélie Lebrun, Ph.D., CM research officer until October 2020

#### Field research during the GP

Lucio Castracani, Ph. D. (2018)

Audrey Gagnon, Ph.D. candidate (2018, 2019)

Aurélie Lebrun, Ph. D. (2018, 2019)

Catherine Montmagny Grenier, Ph. D. (2018, 2019) Mélissa Perreault, M. A. (2018)

Selma Tannouche Bennani, Ph. D. (2019)

#### Research, literature review and data processing

Laurence Lallier-Roussin, M. A. (2019-2020)

Jeanne Reynolds, Ph.D. candidate (2017) Laurence Richard-Nobert, M. A. (2020)

Selma Tannouche Bennani, Ph. D. (2018-2019)

### **Writing**

Aurélie Lebrun, CM research officer until October 2020

### **Coordinator**

Kenza Bennis, CM research secretary

### **English translation**

Marieke Bivar

### **Graphic design**

Sophie Charest

## Table of contents

About the Conseil des Montréalaises .....	5
Introduction .....	6
1. The mandate of the Conseil des Montréalaises.....	8
2. Field research .....	9
3. The definition of human trafficking and the Palermo Protocol.....	10
4. The concerned parties .....	12
5. Media and political hype.....	13
6. Is there an increase in the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation during the GP?.....	14
7. Do major sporting events bring with them an increase in human trafficking?.....	15
8. Measuring human trafficking.....	16
9. Victims of trafficking .....	17
10. A theoretical definition and various practical interpretations.....	18
11. A phenomenon lacking data.....	19
12. The consequences of politically instrumentalizing trafficking.....	20
13. The protection of victims and police repression.....	21
14. Sex workers and human trafficking.....	22
15. Human trafficking and women with precarious or no immigration status.....	23
Take-aways .....	24
What can be done? Recommendations from the Conseil des Montréalaises.....	26
Notes.....	32

## About the Conseil des Montréalaises

The Conseil des Montréalaises (CM) was founded in 2004 and is made up of 15 volunteer members who reflect the diversity of Montreal's women. It acts as a consultative body to the municipal administration on matters related to the status of women and gender equality for all. The council takes an intersectional feminist approach to understanding the different lived realities of Montreal women.

The CM has the following roles:

- Providing opinions, on its own initiative or by request from the City of Montreal's mayor, executive committee, or city council, on matters related to gender equality, equality among women and the status of women, and submitting its recommendations to Montreal city council.
- Soliciting opinions and receiving and considering requests and suggestions from any person or group on matters related to gender equality, equality among women and the status of women.
- Helping develop and implement a gender equality policy framework for municipal employees.
- Conducting or commissioning studies and research it deems useful or necessary to the exercise of its functions.

The CM is an invaluable democratic tool. It is tuned in to the ideas and ways of thinking of feminist citizens and community organizations in the region and keeps up with their analysis and voices. Its main areas of intervention are city life, city governance and working for the City. The CM's work therefore focuses on the quality of life of Montreal women (transport, housing, the fight against poverty, safety, homelessness, sports, and leisure offerings, etc.), on the presence and participation of women in municipal politics and on the working conditions of women who are civil servants.

## Introduction

The Canada Formula 1 Grand Prix (hereafter referred to as the GP) is an international Formula 1 race, the main event in motor sports, and has been held annually in Montreal for the past 32 years.

The Canada GP is an important event for Montreal. The week of the GP marks the beginning of the summer festival season, brings in what are said to be unmatched profits, although this is the subject of some debate, and puts Montreal on the map internationally for the duration of the race.

The GP takes place in different Montreal neighbourhoods: Parc Jean-Drapeau, Little Italy, Old Montreal and downtown, on Crescent and Peel streets, and at place du Canada. Festivities take place in the afternoon, evening and through the night, and draw families, groups of young women, groups of young men, groups of friends, fans from outside the country and fans from Quebec who have been coming to watch the race forever. In Montreal and in other cities across the world, the GP event also features VIP nights, fancy cars and “F1 girls.” For a whole week, part of Montreal dances to the rhythm of the F1.

Since the 2000s, a new narrative has been progressively joining the frenzy around the F1. Many articles in the press, witness accounts and radio interviews have revealed that during the Montreal GP, there is “an increase in the trafficking of women.”<sup>1</sup> According to these sources, the Montreal GP is “a magnet for human trafficking in Canada.”<sup>2</sup>

In response to this alarming and alarmist reality, information campaigns against the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation have appeared on city buses and in the bathrooms of some downtown bars and clubs. Informational pamphlets against human trafficking have been distributed at Pierre-Elliott-Trudeau International Airport and in Montreal hotels. Police operations have been carried specifically targeting demand, or clients. In 2018, grid girls<sup>3</sup> were phased out, considered outdated and “clearly at odds with modern day societal norms.”<sup>4</sup>



In 2017, the Conseil des Montréalaises was given a mandate to evaluate the scope of the phenomenon of the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation affecting the Montreal GP.

Human trafficking, and particularly the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation, is an international concern that led to the adoption, in 2000, of the Palermo Protocol, a Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. The fight against human trafficking is led by numerous national and international bodies through joint preventative, informational and repressive actions that take place, among others, during major international sporting events.

For over twenty years, major important sporting events like the Olympic Games and the FIFA (Fédération Internationale de Football Association) World Cup have, in fact, been associated with an increase in cases of trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation. There are purported to be thousands of victims, although the true extent is unclear.

To fulfill our mandate, we interviewed various Montreal community organizations and conducted field research during the 2018 and 2019 GPs.

**This document contains highlights from “Opinion Paper: The Conseil des Montréalaises on the Trafficking of Women for the Purposes of Sexual Exploitation during the Formula 1 Canadian Grand Prix.” It is made up of texts that resume information that will allow readers to understand the definition of trafficking, its related issues, and the results of our research on the presumed increase in trafficking during the GP. Also included are the 23 recommendations submitted to the City of Montreal and its partners, the Government of Quebec, the Government Canada, and Octane Racing Group.**

# 1. The mandate of the Conseil des Montréalaises

In May 2017, following a request from the mayor's office, members of the Conseil des Montréalaises (CM) was given a three-year research mandate (2017-2020) on the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation during the Canadian Formula 1 (GP).

To fulfill this research mandate, the CM asked two questions:

- 1) What is the extent of the increase in trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation during the GP?
- 2) What are the experiences of women (those working in or frequenting the premises of the GP) when it comes to the violence they experience, their sense of security or lack thereof?

This question brings up several others: what forms of sexist, racist, homophobic, and transphobic violence are present? What are the instances of sexual harassment in public spaces and at GP venues? What does "being safe" mean to these women? What strategies have they developed to be able to go out and have fun during the GP and still feel safe?

The CM understands the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation as one of the forms of violence women may experience during the GP. Historically, the CM has always taken an interest in the different forms of violence that affect women during events organized in Montreal. Women's presence in the city, without the threat of violence, and their full participation in events organized here is one of the ways we can enact true gender equality and equality among women. The CM believes that to ensure our city is safe, we need to guarantee that all women can participate, without discrimination, in decision-making, power-sharing, and accountability<sup>5</sup> when it comes to creating and organizing events.

This document covers the highlights of the CM opinion paper on the trafficking of women during the GP, which presents the first phase of our research fulfilling the mandate we have been given.

An opinion paper on the issue of women's safety during the GP will be the subject of the next phase of our research.



## 2. Field research

For our research, we met with **20 organizations** that work with and advocate for the rights of migrants who are non-status or whose status is precarious, sex workers, victims of sexual exploitation, young, racialized women, Indigenous women, and 2SLGBTQQIA people.

We also organized **meetings or participated in activities with institutional representatives**, including employees of the Service de police de la Ville de Montréal (SPVM) (from the PDQ Centre-ville, Research and Strategic Planning Division, Youth Intervention and Prevention, and the Équipe intégrée de lutte contre le proxénétisme), officials from Canada Economic Development, heads of downtown Montreal and Vieux-Montréal/Old Montreal business development companies (BDCs), Ville-Marie borough officials, and staff from the Octane racing group and the Hotel Association of Greater Montreal (AHGM).

Lastly, we also logged **more than 200 hours of observation**. These observation periods were completed both during the day and at night in **more than 30 bars, restaurants, clubs, and hotels** at various GP sites, such as Parc Jean-Drapeau, downtown and Old Montreal.

### 3. The definition of human trafficking and the Palermo Protocol

The United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, known as the “Palermo Convention,” is a United Nations convention signed in December of 2000 in Palermo, Italy. Its objective is to establish international legal and law enforcement cooperation to improve the prevention and repression of organized crime activities. The Convention is supplemented by three protocols that target specific activities and forms of organized crime. One of these protocols is the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children<sup>6</sup> (which we will hereafter refer to as the Palermo Protocol).

The Palermo Protocol is the first international legal instrument to include a definition of human trafficking agreed upon by a large number of states. It defines human trafficking as follows:

**‘Trafficking in persons’ shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.**  
(Article 3a)

The definition of human trafficking used in the Palermo Protocol focuses on three elements:

- 1) actions: recruiting, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons;**
- 2) forms of coercion: the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion (abduction, fraud, deception, abuse of power or of a position of power);**
- 3) the purpose (goal): the exploitation of the persons.**

The Protocol's goal is also to protect and assist victims of human trafficking with respect for their human rights.<sup>7</sup> For this reason, the fight against human trafficking is built on three pillars: prevention, protection, and repression.

It is important to note that, as mentioned in the Palermo Protocol, human trafficking can take many forms: forced labour, sexual exploitation, domestic servitude, organ trafficking, or forced marriage. Sexual exploitation, however, dominates among efforts employed in the fight against trafficking. The adoption of the Palermo Protocol was the result of intense feminist struggles coordinated on a global scale by international feminist organizations. These organizations monopolized discussions on the terms of the definition of trafficking because of their differing opinions as to what qualifies as trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation, sexual exploitation, and sex work.

## 4. The concerned parties

According to sociologists Anderson and O'Connell Davidson<sup>8</sup>, the debates around human trafficking are specifically held between three main groups of actors:

- Governments. Their interest in trafficking is often grounded in concerns about irregular immigration and/or transnational organised crime, which are viewed as threats to the national security of affected countries.
- National and international abolitionist organizations.<sup>9</sup> These organizations see human trafficking as the globalization of the sexual exploitation of women.
- National and international organizations advocating for migrant workers, in defense of sex workers, the rights of children, and human rights. These organizations see trafficking as a violation of human rights and worker's rights.<sup>10</sup>

## 5. Media and political hype

Each year, intense media coverage irreversibly links the GP to “increased trafficking,” “young women brought to Montreal,” and “very well paid but questionable” “suspicious want ads.” This coverage also features catastrophizing headlines like “double the arrests,” and “four times as many clients arrested,”<sup>11</sup> even though the numbers remain relatively low.<sup>12</sup> The phenomenon they describe is reportedly particularly dangerous for young women.

A few days before the 2017 GP, some MNAs requested the creation of a Select Parliamentary Committee on the Sexual Exploitation of Minors in order to “stop the underage prostitution and procuring that plague more and more women in Quebec,” and to “discuss these scourges, which make the news year after year during the Grand Prix.”<sup>13</sup> Their concern implied that Quebec was a “hub” for the sexual exploitation of minors in North America,<sup>14</sup> that the phenomenon was growing,<sup>15</sup> that young women in Quebec centres jeunesse (youth centres)<sup>16</sup> and young women in Quebec generally, considered a “choice recruiting pool,”<sup>17</sup> were easy to recruit and that teen girls from Quebec were in demand and considered “exotic.”<sup>18</sup>

These alarming statements are also present on the international stage. In the annual reports from the United States Department of State, estimates vary between 4 million<sup>19</sup> and 600 000-800 000 victims.<sup>20</sup> In 2018, in a speech<sup>21</sup> given during National Slavery and Human Trafficking Prevention Month, President of the United States Donald Trump estimated that there were 25 million victims worldwide. According to the Not for Sale organization, “45.8 million people today [are victims of human trafficking and] are living in slave-like conditions. That’s bigger than the population of California, Canada, or Argentina.”<sup>22</sup>

A number of commentators feel that the purpose of the current simplified and simplistic portrayals of human trafficking in political and media discourse is to spark indignation and solicit emotional responses.<sup>23</sup>

## 6. Is there an increase in the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation during the GP?

For the organizations we encountered, an increase in the trafficking of women during the GP is not a given. Although many of these groups are the same ones that carry out campaigns against trafficking and sexual exploitation during the week of the GP, they do not necessarily see a change in their service users or in the services they offer women during that specific period.

A number of groups definitely feel that targeting the GP to denounce a supposed increase in the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation is strategic: “Why these campaigns during the Grand Prix? Because it’s the first event of the season and draws tourists both from outside the country and from other Quebec cities.” (Org. 3)

The GP is, in fact, for a large majority of groups, a “perfect time” or “a means” to highlight a problem that is, in reality, present year-round. To these groups, this issue involves all Montreal festivals and big events, particularly during the summer. (Org. 1, 2, 3, 4)

**Although there is an implicit consensus among these groups on the fact that it is impossible to determine whether there is an increase in the trafficking of women during the GP**, they are also in agreement that there seems to be an increased demand for sexual services during the GP. Depending on the definitions adopted and used by each organization, they may see this increase as either resulting in a rise in sexual exploitation or in more work opportunities for certain women.



## 7. Do major sporting events bring with them an increase in human trafficking?

The data collected during various major sporting events over the past 20 or more years by different researchers is not enough to determine the extent of or whether there is an increase in human trafficking during these types of events.

The 2004 Olympic Games in Athens: no trafficking victims identified during the Games.

The 2006 FIFA World Cup in Germany: an estimate of 40 000 trafficking victims made before the event was unfounded and unrealistic.

The 2008 Olympic Games in Beijing: no cases of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation were reported, although it is felt that authorities were lax in their analysis of the phenomenon.<sup>24</sup>

The 2010 Olympic Games in Vancouver: no evidence was found linking trafficking in persons for the purposes of sexual exploitation to the Games.<sup>25</sup>

The absence of reported trafficking cases when it comes to large-scale sporting events, however, is not enough to conclude that this phenomenon is not present.

## 8. Measuring human trafficking

Authors of studies that maintain that sporting events lead to an increase in demand for sexual services, and therefore in human trafficking acknowledge that quantifying this increase is a challenge.<sup>26</sup>

The authors of this research concluded that their analysis revealed the presence of human trafficking in several cities and at several events, but that they were unable to determine its prevalence during the GP specifically.

They also found that sporting events associated with presumed increases in trafficking did not stand out from other events that were not presumed to be associated with trafficking.<sup>27</sup>

It is important to note, however, that the trafficking of women, like all violence against women, is under-reported. It has also been acknowledged that it is difficult to collect data on both migration and criminalized activities such as sex work. Fear of retaliation or deportation, as well as the stigmas associated with sex work and immigration status are among the reasons cited.<sup>28</sup> The data is also considered to lack credibility due to trafficking being confused with the related phenomenon of irregular and illegal migration.<sup>29</sup> There is also the fact that the definition of trafficking is hard to understand and is considered too abstract, simplistic, and unrepresentative of the reality on the ground.<sup>30</sup>

In all studies conducted on the specific context of large-scale sporting events, **findings on a possible increase in cases of human trafficking have been contradictory, and the estimates as to these phenomena have yet to be corroborated.**

## 9. Victims of trafficking

Identifying victims, meaning determining whether they are “victims of trafficking,” is the subject of a number of political, law enforcement, and legal debates, and ultimately depends on the definition of trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation, sexual exploitation, and sex work. All stakeholders acknowledge that in this context, **the detection of victims is complex.**

This means there is no actual “victims of trafficking” category. The category has been created and influenced by society, and is a product of political, institutional, legal, media and social discourse and decisions. A victim becomes “an object of knowledge” as a result of practices that classify and regulate, that problematize and constitute the designated “victim of trafficking.”<sup>31</sup>

**There is no typical victim profile for trafficking.** We rarely hear the voices of trafficking victims, and there is little interest in them beyond their status as victims of trafficking.<sup>32</sup>

Women in the field are not, by far, the images of the “innocent victims” of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation or of sexual exploitation. This is also why the women who tend to want to file complaints “are seen as acceptable victims, are often women who are not personally at risk of arrest or deportation and are women who have legal status” (Org. 17), and are not drug users, sex workers, Indigenous, or racialized.

## 10. A theoretical definition and various practical interpretations

The organizations we spoke with use various interpretations of the definition in the Palermo Protocol.

The Palermo Protocol definition has been the subject of a number of critiques due to its complexity. It is known to be difficult to apply and interpret legally. It is too sparse and practically useless day to day since it is hard to apply on the ground. In a review of the literature on trafficking, the authors of the review revealed that there are numerous definitions and interpretations of trafficking and that they are sometimes contradictory. Similarly, most representations of the phenomenon are fragmented and also contradictory.<sup>33</sup>

**In short, the definition of trafficking is hard to understand and is considered too abstract, simplistic, and unrepresentative of the reality on the ground.<sup>34</sup>**

## 11. A phenomenon lacking data

There is currently a growing consensus on the fact that the scale and various forms of the trafficking phenomenon are not well known. Although there are many estimates, these give a portrait of the phenomenon that is more impressionistic than realistic, on both a global and national scale.

Governments and others maintain a constant pressure for numerical data on trafficking. What's more, "few public figures speaking on this issue have resisted the temptation to cite trafficking statistics that are at best unverifiable and at worst demonstrably false. The anti-trafficking community as a whole has been unconscionably silent about the shoddy research methodologies that regularly produce the wildly varying numbers on which it so heavily relies. [...] But the simple, unspoken truth is that we just don't know how many people have been or are being exploited."<sup>35</sup>

For many, astronomical estimates are the result of a "moral panic" surrounding trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation, and of sensationalist media coverage that uses the numbers with abandon.<sup>36</sup> Because of this, many people believe that "ideology comes to substitute for evidence,"<sup>37</sup> or that the "supporters of demand-side prohibition [...] manipulate evidence; they rely on research legends and anecdotes that do not stand empirical scrutiny."<sup>38</sup>

**The contradictory nature of research results also illustrates the competing interests and politicization, or polarization, of debates on the subject of the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation as a phenomenon.**

In fact, over the last few years, a number of actors agree that the human trafficking phenomenon is a political issue that is not shaped by realities on the ground.

## 12. The consequences of politically instrumentalizing trafficking

The exaggerated numbers on the trafficking phenomenon, much like the conflation of sexual exploitation and sex work, lead to actions, particularly police actions, that have harmful consequences for some groups of women, including women in the sex industry, Indigenous women, and migrant women.

This political instrumentalization of human trafficking and especially of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation is also a barrier to the development of knowledge as to the phenomenon of human trafficking and does not allow us to focus on issues of safety that genuinely affect women during the GP. The exaggerated estimates of the trafficking phenomenon have the effect of weakening public policies to combat trafficking and rendering them inefficient.<sup>39</sup> The assistance available to victims, for example, is underfunded compared to repressive actions.<sup>40</sup>



## 13. The protection of victims and police repression

The Palermo protocol has faced strong criticism because of its use of repressive logic.<sup>41</sup> It is, in fact, a supplement to the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, which aims to foster international cooperation between police and judicial authorities to combat transnational organized crime.

In general, the increased police presence on the streets during these events can lead to the harassment, discrimination and marginalization of sex workers, unhoused women, drug users and others targeted by police profiling in public spaces.

**Actions to combat human trafficking during the GP in particular have serious consequences on women's sense of security during the event. Many women report being under excessive surveillance and being the victims of police harassment, profiling, and arbitrary arrest.**

The United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, in one of its observations on raids by anti-trafficking units, also reported being concerned at the persecution of women in prostitution as a result of measures taken to address trafficking, such as raid and rescue operations.<sup>42</sup>

Although these interventions during major events are timely, they also establish all kinds of precedents, which Lancaster refers to as “residues of laws and structures,”<sup>43</sup> that remain in place and are used to other ends. In the case of the 2014 FIFA World Cup in Rio de Janeiro, researchers showed that the sexual panic around the event had been used to push “problematic” segments of the population out of gentrified neighbourhoods and had led to heightened controls to reinforce this segregation, while the official line was that this was to protect and defend human rights.<sup>44</sup>

## 14. Sex workers and human trafficking

Associating the trafficking of women with sexual exploitation and the sex industry renders other forms of human trafficking invisible. It also obscures the political and institutional violence experienced by sex workers. According to one advocate,

**“ what we know, [...] from a more general standpoint and outside of the legal framework, is that human trafficking, on a social level, could be seen as a talking point, a concept used to justify the oppression and hatred of sex workers, and to infantilize sex workers and try to make it so that our voices and our own perspectives on our lives are considered invalid. ”**  
(Org. 17)

Groups working with sex workers spoke about the sexual assault these workers experience. These groups also point out that the failure to recognize the sexual violence experienced by sex workers and understanding their experiences only in terms of sexual exploitation limits their ability to assert their rights.

Groups that work with migrant women in particular would also like to see the recognition of situations of sexual violence that are not the result of trafficking for the purposes of exploitation as currently defined.

## 15. Human trafficking and women with precarious or no immigration status

According to organizations working with migrants and temporary workers, the real problem in cases of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation or forced labour is the precarity of immigration status: the lack of status for non-status women, pending legal status for asylum seekers, and legal but temporary status for temporary workers are all examples of this.

The majority of women who are the most vulnerable to trafficking and other forms of exploitation are racialized women who do lack legal status in Canada.

Their precarious immigration status and financial situation in a broader sense force them to stay silent. When it comes to human trafficking, sexual exploitation and forced labour often intersect. For example, women who are brought to Canada as domestic workers often experience both forced labour and also sexual exploitation. (Org. 4, 14, 16)

The groups we met with, particularly those concerned with forced labour and migrant and non-status women, feel that:

**we can combat the trafficking of migrant women by giving them legal status [...] Trafficking is on a spectrum of exploitation. The human rights violations involved are related to sexual exploitation, discrimination, harassment, dismissal due to pregnancy discrimination, unequal treatment, violations of the Criminal Code, etc.**  
(Org. 14)

The services needed by victims of trafficking overlap and may be similar to those of other population groups that have experienced abuse or other forms of exploitation. Research regularly shows that, in Canada, victims of trafficking do not have access to housing, health services, or security mechanisms to prevent future reprisals.<sup>45</sup>

## Take-aways

- The majority of groups state that they are unable to show any particular increase in cases of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation during the GP.

It has been established in the scientific literature that the possibility of an increase in the trafficking of women in the context of sporting events does not have a clear answer: study results are often contradictory.

Specialists measuring the number of victims of trafficking agree that little is yet known about the experiences and profiles of these victims. The many estimates give a portrait of the phenomenon that is more impressionistic than realistic.

- Human trafficking is not only an issue of sexual exploitation.

It can take different forms, such as forced labour, sexual exploitation, domestic servitude, organ trafficking and forced marriage.

- Human trafficking is exploitation characterized by a use of force and coercion that causes victimized persons to fear for their safety.

Human trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation is distinct from sex work.

- Law enforcement and legal approaches to trafficking have a negative impact on groups of people who, paradoxically, are seen as trafficking's main victims.

Combatting human trafficking must not translate into combatting sex work or migrant women.

- Analyzing human trafficking as a unique and uniform phenomenon makes public policy objectives weaker and lessens their capacity to prevent and eradicate human trafficking.<sup>46</sup>

The misrepresentative and incorrect portrayals of victims comes up short when it comes to summing up the issues of human trafficking and sexual exploitation in Montreal.

The current simplified and simplistic portrayals of human trafficking in political and media discourse are designed to spark indignation and solicit emotional responses.<sup>47</sup>

## What can be done?

Recommendations from the Conseil des Montréalaises





The CM has drafted 23 recommendations to the City of Montreal, including one that is also intended for the Government of Canada.

## Recommendations to the City of Montreal and related bodies to guide the city's interventions on human trafficking

### Taking action on human trafficking at the municipal level

**R1** That the City of Montreal recognize that human trafficking is present on its territory.

- a) That the City of Montreal adopt a broad definition of trafficking that includes exploitation for the purposes of forced labour and sexual exploitation, national and international trafficking of minors or family-related exploitation (forced marriage, domestic servitude, or adoption for example).
- b) That the City of Montreal recognize the difference between trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation, sexual exploitation, and sex work.
- c) That the City of Montreal recognize that different forms of trafficking can sometimes be distinct, linked, or concurrent.

**R2** That the City of Montreal communicate this position to its known partners (the SPVM, the provincial and federal governments, Tourisme Montréal, the relevant municipal services) and reach out to the sectors affected (the tourism industry, community organizations, etc.).

**R3** That the City of Montreal help to deconstruct myths around human trafficking in all its actions during major tourist events including the Formula 1 Grand Prix, particularly when it comes to municipal safety. That the City do so through the publication and distribution of awareness materials that are specifically anti-racist and anti-sexist, and that it take care to avoid using images and representations of trafficking that are stereotypical and monolithic.

**R4** That the City of Montreal make representations to the provincial government to reform the Crime Victims Compensation Act to include victims of human trafficking.

### **Service de police de la Ville de Montréal (SPVM) and the City of Montreal**

**R5** That the SPVM and the City of Montreal recognize that the practices of police units intervening in matters of human trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation and matters of sexual exploitation, particularly those of the criminal investigation services, are discriminatory towards a number of population groups including sex workers, Indigenous women, and substance users.

**R6** That the SPVM and the City of Montreal organize, within the framework of their work to combat human trafficking, annual mandatory training on the different forms that forced labour can take, and that this training be based on testimony from people who have been the victims of forced labour. That this training be provided to all employees, particularly investigators.

**R7** That the SPVM and the City of Montreal document the profiles (gender, age, ethnic origin) of those detained, arrested, or aided as well as the type of interventions used by police forces present during each Formula 1 Grand Prix. The police units in question include the Brigades des espaces publics, the Emergency Measures and Antiterrorism Module, neighbourhood police, the Section Éclipse, the Groupe tactique d'intervention, the Sûreté du Québec, and the RCMP.

a) That the SPVM and the City of Montreal make this report public in the six months following the close of the event.

**R8** That the SPVM and the City of Montreal stop targeting sex workers, particularly migrant sex workers and those with precarious immigration status, during police operations to combat human trafficking and sexual exploitation during the Formula 1 Grand Prix and throughout the year.

**R9** That the SPVM and the City of Montreal create an action plan in collaboration with women who are part of, or who have been part of the sex industry to provide a framework for police interventions in the industry.

**R10** That the SPVM and the City of Montreal put in place a specific mechanism for responding to complaints filed by sex workers against the police.

**R11** That the SPVM and the City of Montreal prioritize developing and maintaining internal expertise on Indigenous people in Montreal by hiring Indigenous staff at the SPVM, particularly for liaison officer positions and as investigators for the criminal investigation services.

### **Taking action on the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation from a collective and community standpoint**

**R12** That the City of Montreal offer recurring funding to groups specializing in street work that have expertise with or develop initiatives for Indigenous communities and 2SLGBTQIA people and work together with these communities with a view to preventing and intervening on these issues.

**R13** That the City of Montreal create a consultative committee on sex work made up of the various stakeholders in order to improve the safety and health of sex workers and prevent trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation.

- a) That the City of Montreal ensure that this committee is created together with sex workers, minors who are or have been in the sex industry, as well as victims of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation, and that it ensure their inclusion.

**R14** That the City of Montreal create a municipal strategy on the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation and on sexual exploitation and that it adopt a “by and for” approach. That the City do so by inviting the different stakeholders from the community sector, public health sector, and health and social services to contribute their ideas.

**R15** That the City of Montreal take leadership and reach an agreement with the SPVM, the Sûreté du Québec, and the RCMP to stop reporting non-status persons, particularly women, to the Canada Border Services Agency, which will proceed to detain and deport them.

## Prevention and protective factors

### Short term shelter and social housing

**R16** That the City of Montreal, in partnership with the appropriate bodies, support, through recurring and adequate funding, day and night shelters for Indigenous women, 2SLGBTQQIA people, and substance users where consumption is authorized (wet shelters), as a way of promoting harm reduction and the prevention of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation.

**R17** That the City of Montreal create a funding program for short-term stay (a few weeks to a few months) shelter projects with community support for young people experiencing temporary precarious situations.

**R18** That the City of Montreal fund the development of social housing that is culturally adapted for Indigenous people and that these projects be conceived and developed in partnership with Indigenous people.

## Conducting consultations and research to prevent the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation

**R19** That any policies, action plans, and programs financed or implemented by the City of Montreal addressing human trafficking of adults or minors for the purposes of sexual exploitation be the subject of consultations that include representatives from each group of stakeholders.

a) That the City of Montreal ensure that every child's right to be consulted is respected.<sup>48</sup>

b) That the City of Montreal ensure that the content of its policies, action plans, and programs include the recommendations of stakeholders.

**R20** That the City of Montreal remunerate all marginalized persons participating in consultations or working committees, particularly people who are victims of sexual exploitation, sex workers, trans, migrants, and substance users, as well as the community organizations that represent them.

**R21** That the City of Montreal, in collaboration with the Government of Quebec, Tourisme Montréal, business development companies and any other relevant partner, document the presence of forced labour within the tourism industry.

**R22** That the City of Montreal fund a study on the impacts of the police managing women's safety during major events held in Montreal public spaces.

a) That the City of Montreal make this report public in the six months following the close of the event.

### **Recommendation to the City of Montreal and the Government of Canada for implementation as of the 2021 Formula 1 Grand Prix**

**R23** That the City of Montreal and the federal government, with the purpose of honouring Canada's international commitments to protect victims of human trafficking, provide long-term funding to community organizations advocating for human rights of Indigenous people and migrants who are non-status or have precarious immigration status, in order to ensure the stability and efficiency of the services provided to these communities.

## Notes

- 1 [Our translation]. Champagne, S. (2017). “Grand Prix: hausse du trafic des femmes aux frontières.” Published June 9, 2017. *Le Devoir*. Online: <https://www.ledevoir.com/societe/500779/grand-prix-prostitution>.
- 2 [Our translation]. Maria Mourani in the Quebec National Assembly (2019). *Journal des débats de la Commission spéciale sur l'exploitation sexuelle des mineurs*, 45 (3), November 6, 2019. Online: <http://m.assnat.qc.ca/fr/travaux-parlementaires/commissions/csesm-42-1/journal-debats/CSESM-191106.html>.
- 3 Grid girl: A young woman holding a car or motorcycle race driver's flag or umbrella on the starting grid.
- 4 Formula 1. (2018). *Formula 1 to stop using Grid girls*. Published January 31, 2018. Online: <https://www.formula1.com/en/latest/article.formula-1-to-stop-using-grid-girls.5HPVglzLHOcliGaAS8eOWE.html>.
- 5 City of Montreal. (2008). *Pour une participation égalitaire des femmes et des hommes à la vie de Montréal. Plan d'action 2015-2018*, p. 6.
- 6 Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, November 15, 2000, 2237 UNTC 319 (entry into force: 25 December 2003).
- 7 Article 2 states the purpose of the Protocol:
  - a) To prevent and combat trafficking in persons, paying particular attention to women and children;
  - b) To protect and assist the victims of such trafficking, with full respect for their human rights; and
  - c) To promote cooperation among States Parties in order to meet those objectives.
- 8 Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J. (2002). *Trafficking – a demand led problem? A Multi-Country Pilot*. Save the Children Sweden, p. 5-6. Online: <https://documentation.lastradainternational.org/lsidocs/11%20Trafficking%20-%20a%20demand%20led%20problem.pdf>



- 9 “Abolitionist” in this context means for the abolition of sex work and is also a reference to the movement to abolish slavery. Abolitionist groups are associated with the radical feminist tendency.
- 10 Anderson, B. and O’Connell Davidson, J. *Op. cit.*
- 11 [Our translation]. Gonthier, V. (2019). “Les proxénètes comblent l’offre: des jeunes femmes amenées à Montréal pour le Grand Prix.” Published June 8, 2019. *Le Journal de Montréal*. Online: <https://www.journaldemontreal.com/2019/06/08/les-proxenetes-comblent-loffre>; Champagne, S. (2017). *Op. cit.*; Larin, V. (2017). “Les arrestations ont doublé au Grand Prix. La demande de services sexuels est en croissance.” Published June 14, 2017. *Le Journal de Montréal*. Online: <https://www.journaldemontreal.com/2017/06/14/grand-prix-deux-fois-plus-darrestations-pour-des-services-sexuels>; Gonthier, V. (2019). “Attention aux offres d’emploi très payantes mais douteuses.” Published June 3, 2019. *Le Journal de Montréal*. Online: <https://www.journaldemontreal.com/2019/06/03/attention-aux-offres-demploi-tres-payantes-mais-douteuses>; Gonthier, V. (2019). “Offres d’emploi louches pour jeunes femmes.” Published June 3, 2019. *Le Journal de Québec*. Online: <https://www.tvanouvelles.ca/2019/06/03/offres-demploi-louches-pour-jeunes-femmes-durant-la-f1>; Dumont, M.-E. (2017). “Quatre fois plus de clients arrêtés qu’en 2016.” *Le Journal de Québec*. Published June 10, 2017. Online: <https://www.journaldequebec.com/2017/06/10/quatre-fois-plus-de-clients-arretes-quen-2016>.
- 12 [Our translation]. “The Grand Prix has yet to begin but police have already arrested four times as many people as last year for soliciting sexual services from minors,” reads a 2017 article in the *Journal de Québec* referring to the 10 or so arrests made in 2016 and the 14 (according to initial reports) in 2017. Dumont, M.-E. *Op. cit.*
- The *Journal de Montréal* also reported, during the same period, that “the number of arrests for soliciting sexual services has nearly doubled during the Formula 1 Grand Prix this year, and authorities are seeing an increased demand for these services” [Our translation]. There were 17 arrests for soliciting minors and four for procuring or human trafficking. Larin, V. (2017). “Les arrestations ont doublé au Grand Prix.” *Op. cit.*
- 13 [Our Translation] Agence QMI. (2017). “Prostitution durant le Grand Prix et fugues aux centres jeunesse.” Published June 4, 2017. *TVA Nouvelles*. Online: <https://www.tvanouvelles.ca/2017/06/04/prostitution-durant-le-grand-prix-et-fugues-aux-centres-jeunesse>.

- 14 Bossé, O. (2019). "Exploitation sexuelle des mineurs: les Québécoises en demande." Published November 4, 2019. *Le Soleil*. Online: <https://www.ledroit.com/actualites/le-fil-groupe-capitales-medias/exploitation-sexuelle-des-mineurs-les-quebecoises-en-demande-b11dfc838c3a8ed467b643b73658b4eb>; Gamache, V. (2019). "Exploitation sexuelle des mineurs : Le Québec, une pépinière pour le reste du Canada." Published November 4, 2019. Radio-Canada. Online: <https://ici.radio-canada.ca/nouvelle/1372886/exploitation-sexuelle-mineurs-quebec-pepiniere-canada>.  
Croteau, M. (2019). "Le Québec est une « plaque tournante » de l'exploitation sexuelle des mineurs." Published November 5, 2019. *La Presse*. Online: <https://www.lapresse.ca/actualites/2019-11-04/exploitation-sexuelle-des-mineurs-quebec-est-une-plaque-tournante>.
- 15 Jung, D. (2019). Jung, D. (2019). "Commission sur l'exploitation sexuelle : entre répression et sensibilisation." Published November 4, 2019. Radio-Canada. Online: <https://ici.radio-canada.ca/nouvelle/1375765/crime-entre-repression-sensibilisation-objectifs-commission-exploitation-sexuelle>; Gonthier, V. (2019). "Il est temps de faire la guerre aux pimps." Published November 9, 2019. *Le Journal de Montréal*. Online: <https://www.journaldemontreal.com/2019/11/08/il-est-temps-de-faire-la-guerre-aux-pimps>; Gonthier, V. (2019). "Exploitation sexuelle: les adolescentes «aventureuses» inquiètent les autorités." Published November 9, 2019. *Le Journal de Montréal*. Online: <https://www.journaldemontreal.com/2019/11/09/laventureuse-inquiete-les-autorites>.
- 16 Marin, S. (2019). "Exploitation sexuelle des mineurs : du recrutement dans les centres jeunesse." Published 6 November 2019. *HuffPost Québec*.
- 17 Villeneuve, C. (2019). "Société de pimps." Published 9 November 2019. *Le Journal de Québec*. Online: <https://www.journaldequebec.com/2019/11/09/societe-de-pimps>.
- 18 Gonthier, V. (2019). "Il est temps de faire la guerre aux pimps." *Op. cit.*
- 19 United States department of State. (2002). *Trafficking in Persons Report*. Online: <https://2009-2017.state.gov/documents/organization/10815.pdf>.
- 20 United States department of State. (2007). *Trafficking in Persons Report*. Online: <https://2009-2017.state.gov/documents/organization/82902.pdf>.

- 21 United States department of State. (2018). *Recognizing National Slavery and Human Trafficking Prevention Month*. Published 5 January 2018. Blog post. Online: <https://2017-2021.state.gov/recognizing-national-slavery-and-human-trafficking-prevention-month/index.html>.
- 22 Not for Sale Campaign. (n.d.) *Learn Why We Fight Exploitation*. Online: <https://www.notforsalecampaign.org/why-exploitation/>.
- 23 Ricard-Guay, A. (2015). *Exploitation sexuelle d'adolescentes et jeunes femmes au Québec: perception et interventions. De l'ambivalence des sujets aux dilemmes d'intervention*. Doctoral thesis, School of Social Work, McGill University. Online: <https://escholarship.mcgill.ca/concern/theses/1544bs366>, p. 20.
- 24 Finkel, R. and Finkel, M. L. (2015). "The "Dirty Downside" of Global Sporting Events: Focus on Human Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation." *Public Health*, 129(1), p. 20.
- 25 Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women Canada (2013). 2010 Winter Games Analysis on Human Trafficking. Public Safety Canada. Online: <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsracs/pblctns/wntr-gms-2010/index-en.aspx>, p. 61.
- 26 Palmer, C. (2011). *Violence against Women and Sport: A Literature Review*. End Violence Against Women/Trust for London. Online: [https://www.womensaid.ie/assets/files/pdf/violence\\_against\\_women\\_and\\_sport\\_evaw.pdf](https://www.womensaid.ie/assets/files/pdf/violence_against_women_and_sport_evaw.pdf), p. 3.
- 27 Miller, K., Kennedy, E. and Dubrawski, A. (2016). *Do Public Events Affect Sex Trafficking Activity?* Auton Lab, Carnegie Mellon University. Online: <https://arxiv.org/pdf/1602.05048v1.pdf>.

- 28 Doezema, J. (2000). "Loose Women or Lost Women? The Re-emergence of the Myth of White Slavery in Contemporary Discourses of Trafficking in Women." *Gender Issues*, 18(1), p. 23-50; Laczko, F. and Gramegna, M. (2003). "Developing Better Indicators of Human Trafficking." *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, X(1), p. 179-194; Agustin, L. (2005). "Migrants in the Mistress's House: Other Voices in the "Trafficking" Debate." *Social Politics*, 12(1), p. 96-117; Kempadoo, K. (dir.). (2005). *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights*. Ann Arbor: Paradigm Publishers;
- Albanese, J. (2007). *Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children: What Do We Know and What Do We Do About It? Special Report*. U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, National Institute of Justice. December 2007. Online: <https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/215733.pdf>.
- 29 Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J. *Op. cit.*
- 30 Ricci, S., Kurtzman, L. and Roy, M.-A. (2012). *Synthèse du rapport. La traite des femmes à des fins d'exploitation sexuelle: entre le déni et l'invisibilité*. Montréal: Université du Québec à Montréal, Institut de recherches et d'études féministes, p. 8. Online: <https://reqef.uqam.ca/publications/autres-parutions/la-traite-des-femmes-des-fins-dexploitation-sexuelle-entre-le-deni-et-linvisibilite-par-sandrine-ricci-lyne-kurtzman-et-marie-andree-roy-les-cahiers-de-l/>.
- 31 Bacchi, C. (2012). "Why study problematizations? Making politics visible." *Open Journal of Political Science*, 2(1), p. 3, in Leser, J., Pates, R. and Dölemeyer, A. (2017). "The Emotional Leviathan - How Street-Level Bureaucrats Govern Human Trafficking Victims." *Digithum*, 19(19), p. 7; Lee, M. (2011). *Trafficking and Global Crime Control*. London: SAGE.
- 32 Brennan, D. (2005). "Methodological Challenges in Research with Trafficked Persons: Tales from the Field." *International Migration*, 43(1/2).
- 33 Breuil, B. C. O., Siegel, D., van Reenen, P. et al. (2011). "Human trafficking revisited: Legal, enforcement and ethnographic narratives on sex trafficking to Western Europe." *Trends Organ Crim*, 14, p. 32, in Byrne, T. and Hamer, C. (2016). *National Evaluation of the Canadian Women's Foundation's Multi-Year Anti-Trafficking Grants Literature Scan Findings*. Violence Prevention Canadian Women's Foundation, p. 4.
- 34 Ricci, S., Kurtzman, L. and Roy, M.-A. *Op. cit.*, p. 8.

- 35 Gallagher, A. T. (2017). *Four Dangerous Assumptions about Human Trafficking*. World Economic Forum. Online: <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2017/08/4-fallacies-slowing-the-fight-against-human-trafficking/>, p. 3.
- 36 Quaterman, L., Kaye, J. and Winterdyk, J. (2012). *Human trafficking in Calgary: Informing a localized response*. ACT Alberta, Mount Royal University, Centre for Criminology & Justice Research. Online: <https://www.actalberta.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/traffickingincalgary.pdf>, p. 7; Milivojevic, S. and Pickering, S. (2008). "Football and sex: The 2006 FIFA World Cup and sex trafficking." *Temida*, 11(2), p. 21-47.
- 37 Chuang, J. (2010). "Rescuing Trafficking from Ideological Capture: Prostitution Reform and Anti-trafficking Law and Policy." *University of Pennsylvania Law Review*, 158(6), p. 1721.
- 38 Lowman, J. (n.d.) *Hyperbole Exposed. Brief to the Senate Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs on the Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act*. Online: [https://sencanada.ca/content/sen/committee/412/lcjc/briefs/c-36/sm\\_c-36\\_brief\\_john\\_lowman\\_e.pdf](https://sencanada.ca/content/sen/committee/412/lcjc/briefs/c-36/sm_c-36_brief_john_lowman_e.pdf), p. 1.
- 39 Quaterman, L., Kaye, J. and Winterdyk, J. *Op. cit.*, p. 17.
- 40 Bonthuys, E. (2012). The 2010 Football World Cup and the Regulation of Sex Work in South Africa. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 38(1), p. 11-29.
- 41 Gallagher, A. T. (2001). "Human Rights and the New UN Protocols on Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling - A Preliminary Analysis." *Human Rights Quarterly*, 23(4), p. 975-1004; Fitzpatrick, J. (2002-2003). "Trafficking as a human rights violation: The complex intersection of legal frameworks for conceptualizing and combating trafficking." *Michigan Journal of International Law*, 24, p. 1143-1168; Defeis, E. (2004). "Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons: A new approach." *Journal of International and Comparative Law*, 10(2), p. 485-491.
- 42 Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (2014). *Concluding observations on the combined fourth and fifth periodic reports of India*. Online: <http://docstore.ohchr.org/SelfServices/FilesHandler.ashx?enc=6QkG1d%2FPPrICAqhKb7yhsgA84bcFRy75ulvS2cmS%2F%2BhR1fgqxKiywURSOaVJOk6sBezpvV1AKQkt7wGc58af2oKanQAXf3ZokcF4ILNQW3aowezgzPbWNFk6DxKOdgBL3jR4b3T%2FI4Sd708kJzmcxvg%3D%3D>.

- 43 Lancaster R. N. (2012). *Sex Panics and the Punitive State*. University of California Press, in Blanchette, T. and da Silva, A. P. (2016). "Brazil has its eye on you": Sexual panic and the threat of sex tourism in Rio de Janeiro during the FIFA World Cup, 2014. *Brasiliana: Journal of Brazilian Studies*, 4(2), p. 414.
- 44 Blanchette, T. and da Silva, A. P. (2016). "Brazil has its eye on you": Sexual panic and the threat of sex tourism in Rio de Janeiro during the FIFA World Cup, 2014. *Brasiliana: Journal of Brazilian Studies*, 4(2), p. 414.
- 45 United States department of State. (2018). *Trafficking in Persons Report 2018*. Office of the Undersecretary for Civilian Security, Democracy, and Human Rights. Online: <https://2017-2021.state.gov/trafficking-in-persons-report-2018/index.html>; Hanley, J. and Ricard-Guay, A. (2014). *Frontline Responses to Human Trafficking in Canada: Coordinating Services for Victims*. Comité d'action contre la traite humaine interne et internationale (CATHII), School of Social Work, McGill University. Online: [http://www.cathii.org/sites/www.cathii.org/files/CATHII\\_english.pdf](http://www.cathii.org/sites/www.cathii.org/files/CATHII_english.pdf); Delas, O. and Plouffe-Malette, K. (2013). "La Convention du Conseil de l'Europe sur la lutte contre la traite des êtres humains face au droit de l'Union européenne." *Criminologie*, 46(1), p. 157-177.
- 46 Efrat, A. (2016). Global Efforts against Human Trafficking: The Misguided Conflation of Sex, Labor, and Organ Trafficking. *International Studies Perspectives*, 17(1), p. 34-54.
- 47 Ricard-Guay, A. (2015). *Op. cit.*, p. 20.
- 48 Article 12 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child.

**CONSEIL DES MONTRÉALAISES**

1550 Metcalfe, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor, Suite 1424  
Montréal, Quebec H3A 1X6  
Telephone: 514-868-5809

[conseildesmontrealaises@montreal.ca](mailto:conseildesmontrealaises@montreal.ca)  
[ville.montreal.qc.ca/conseildesmontrealaises](http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/conseildesmontrealaises)

 [ConseilDesMontrealaises](#)

